

**AUDITOR GENERAL'S DEPARTMENT
PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT**

**TOURISM PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT COMPANY (TPDCo)
GOVERNANCE & PROJECT MANAGEMENT**



The Auditor General is appointed by the Governor General and is required by the Constitution, Financial Administration and Audit Act, other sundry acts, and letters of engagement, to conduct audits at least once per year of the accounts, financial transactions, operations and financial statements of central government ministries and departments, local government agencies, statutory bodies and government companies. The Department is headed by the Auditor General, Pamela Monroe Ellis, who submits her reports to the Speaker of the House of Representatives in accordance with Section 122 of the Constitution of Jamaica and Section 29 of the Financial Administration and Audit Act. This report was prepared by the Auditor General's Department of Jamaica for presentation to the House of Representatives.



'A better Country through effective audit scrutiny'

Auditor General of Jamaica
 Auditor General's Department
 40 Knutsford Boulevard
 Kingston 5, Jamaica, W.I.
www.auditorgeneral.gov.jm

| Document No.: | Date Published |
|---------------------|------------------|
| AuGD 172-1602.143.2 | 2022 February 25 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>WHAT WE FOUND</i> | 9 |
| <i>RECOMMENDATIONS</i> | 12 |
| PART 1: INTRODUCTION | 13 |
| ORGANIZATION AND STAFFING | 13 |
| AUDIT RATIONALE, OBJECTIVE, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY | 15 |
| PART 2 PROJECTS: PROGRAMMES, PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACTS | 17 |
| ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES | 17 |
| ABSENCE OF FEASIBILITY STUDY TO SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION OF PROJECTS | 18 |
| TPDCO’S PROJECT MANAGEMENT WAS DEFICIENT | 18 |
| PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACTS MANAGEMENT | 21 |
| MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF PROJECTS | 22 |
| PART 3 CORPORATE MANAGEMENT PRACTICES | 23 |
| OVERSIGHT AND STRATEGIC DIRECTION | 24 |
| BOARD PERFORMANCE AND EVALUATION | 24 |
| STRATEGIC MONITORING, AND REPORTING | 25 |
| REPORTING ON ITS PERFORMANCE | 25 |
| HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AND PRACTICES..... | 26 |
| APPENDICES | 28 |
| APPENDIX 1: AUDIT QUESTIONS | 28 |
| APPENDIX 2: AUDIT CRITERIA AND SOURCE | 29 |
| APPENDIX 3: CONTRACTS EXECUTED UNDER 11 PROJECTS WITHOUT RISK ASSESSMENTS AND CRITERIA..... | 30 |
| APPENDIX 4: CONTRACTS EXECUTED UNDER TIP WITHOUT EVIDENCE OF RISK ASSESSMENTS AND CRITERIA..... | 32 |
| APPENDIX 5: CONTRACTS WITH NO START DATE | 37 |
| APPENDIX 6: CONTRACTS WITH NO COMPLETION DATE..... | 38 |
| APPENDIX 7: CONTRACTS WITH NO AGREEMENT DATE..... | 39 |
| APPENDIX 8: EMPLOYMENT POSITIONS ENGAGED WITHOUT EVIDENCE OF COMPETITIVE PROCESS..... | 40 |
| APPENDIX 9: POSTS ENGAGED WITHOUT REQUIRED QUALIFICATION | 41 |
| ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS | 43 |



Building Blocks of Value for Money





Audit at a Glance

Project Management and Governance Arrangements at TPDCo



Key Data

- Tourism is the third highest generator of foreign exchange for the Jamaican economy.
- In 2018, the direct contribution of tourism to Jamaica's GDP stood at 9.2 per cent.
- TPDCo is mandated to facilitate the maintenance, development, and enhancement of the tourism product.

Main Findings

- We saw no evidence that TPDCo conducted feasibility studies or risk assessments for 11 projects value at \$478 million, prior to Board approval.
- TPDCo engaged eight employees for substantive positions, including five executive level staff, with annual emoluments totalling \$31.3 million, who did not possess the required minimum education qualification.
- The Ministry of Tourism did not conduct an annual assessment of TPDCo's Board and committees, contrary to the Cabinet approved Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies, 2012.



Conclusion & Recommendation

- TPDCo had in place the necessary governance structure, but there was need for improvement in some areas including its HR practices and performance reporting. Additionally, TPDCo's project management practices were not always effective in enabling the achievement of full value for money spent.
- TPDCO should strengthen its project management and fully implement the approved SOP which requires the conduct of feasibility studies prior to board approval and project implementation.
- TPDCO must immediately take steps to improve its HRA practices to ensure compliance with its HRA policy and best practice.

This report contains our findings on
Project Management and Governance
Arrangements at the
Tourism Product Development Company
(TPDCo).



Auditor General's Overview

National Outcome 12 of Vision 2030 Jamaica National Development Plan (NDP) identifies Tourism as one of Jamaica's leading industries, being a major contributor to GDP and employment, as well as the largest foreign exchange earner. National Outcome 12 also acknowledges the need to improve the standards and level of customer service in the tourism industry. Accordingly, the Tourism Product Development Company (TPDCo), an agency of the Ministry of Tourism and Entertainment, was mandated to facilitate the maintenance, development, and enhancement of the tourism product.

Against the background of Vision 2030 objectives and the importance of the tourism sector to the economy, amplified by the adverse impact of the COVID-19 on visitor arrivals, we conducted a performance audit to determine the extent to which TPDCo was efficiently and effectively managing its project-related activities in accordance with its mandate. We sought to assess the adequacy of TPDCo's systems of internal control and contract management for the tourism projects under its purview over the review period. We found that TPDCo had in place the necessary governance structure, despite the need for improvement in some areas including its human resource practices and performance reporting. Further, consistent with its mandate, TPDCo sought to increase the range of product offerings in the tourism sector and in March 2019, implemented guidelines and the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for the management of projects. Further, TPDCo's stated commitment to the conduct of feasibility studies and cost benefit analyses prior to the approving of projects, should auger well for the implementation of affordable and high impact projects for the tourism sector. Nonetheless, we noted opportunities for improvement as TPDCo's records management was deficient and we identified weaknesses with project management processes in the absence of feasibility studies.

I wish to express my sincere thanks to the management and staff of TPDCo for the cooperation and assistance given to my staff, during the audit. Thanks to all stakeholders who provided valuable insight on the impact of TPDCo's core functions.



Pamela Monroe Ellis, FCCA, FCA
Auditor General

This report contains our findings on
Project Management and Governance
Arrangements at the
Tourism Product Development Company
(TPDCo).





Key Audit Question

Is TPDCo efficiently managing the projects under its purview in accordance with the goals and objectives of the tourism sector?

What We Found

Project Management

We expected TPDCo to develop criteria for project selection and prioritization and to conduct a financial review or cash flow analysis to inform its investment decisions regarding project selection and implementation. We saw no evidence that TPDCo reviewed the feasibility/viability of the projects selected, prior to implementation. TPDCO's management developed and implemented guidelines and the standard operating procedure (SOP) for the management of projects in March 2019, demonstrating its commitment to high standards in the Tourism Sector. However, despite the entity's best efforts, TPDCo did not faithfully adhere to the guidelines and SOP.

Key findings are summarized below.

- 1 Consistent with its mandate to build consensus and strategic alliances with industry stakeholders, TPDCo, adopted a consultative approach in engaging stakeholders in the identification of tourism related projects.** TPDCO also considered projects based on review of the established Master Plan for Sustainable Tourism Development (2002) as well as the Comprehensive Resort Upgrading Programme (CRUP). The approved Master Plan outlined location strategies and resort development for various sites by parishes, marketing strategy and other aspects of the tourism industry. At the same time, we expected TPDCO to prioritize projects based on objective criteria, that would maximise the returns from the expenditure incurred on projects. From a sample of 11 projects selected for review, with a contractual value of \$478 million, we saw no evidence that TPDCo assessed the feasibility of the projects or conducted risk assessments prior to Board approval. Best practice dictates that these procedures would inform the decision-making process.

TPDCo's records indicated that the Projects Unit prepared Board submissions, but these did not include feasibility assessments or identified the risks related to the projects. In March 2019, TPDCO developed a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP), which required that upon receiving an approved Project Application Form, the entity should "develop Project Concept and carry out feasibility studies - develop Initial Budget and financial viability studies prior to detailed designs, when deciding on a project". However, we saw no evidence of conformity with the SOP, after implementation in March 2019. In October 2021, TPDCO responded that "conducting feasibility studies, risk assessment and cost benefit analysis are to be enforced. Instructions have been sent to all Projects Department Staff for these steps to be taken on all projects."



2 TPDCo manages the Tourism Improvement Programme (TIP)¹, which spans the 63 constituencies and involves several municipal corporations and licensed agencies. Under TIP, each constituency was allocated \$3 million annually to undertake projects, which was subsequently increased to \$4 million during the financial year 2019-20. TPDCo's records showed that 315 contracts valued at \$1.078 billion were executed over the period 2014-15 to 2019-20. The TIP was expected to address the insufficient spread of the benefits of tourism to communities within and outside the main tourist areas, assist in improving access to some of the areas where attractions are located and assist in the diversification of Jamaica's tourism product. Hence, we expected TPDCo to select and prioritize projects based on established criteria that align with the company's main objective of enhancing the tourism product and offering the best value for money spent. Despite our request, TPDCo did not provide evidence of the criteria used to select the projects. We reviewed 60 of the 315 contracts and noted that in some cases there was no apparent linkage between the project and the value to the tourism sector. Examples of 12 such projects are highlighted in **Table 1 below**. Further, we were unable to determine whether the 60 selected contracts were completed on time due to the absence of completion dates and actual completion certificates.

Table 1: Projects Executed Under TIP

| Year of Project | Contract Sum | Constituency | Type of Work |
|-----------------|----------------|----------------------------|---|
| 2015/16 | \$3,001,236.51 | CLARENDON NORTHCENTRAL | Construction of netball court and football field at Summerfield Community Centre |
| 2016/17 | \$3,015,000.00 | ST. ANDREW WESTERN | Rehabilitate the Duhaney Park recreational park |
| 2016/17 | \$3,001,950.00 | ST. ANDREW NORTHWESTERN | Rehabilitation of Pembroke Close Road. |
| 2016/17 | \$3,497,445.00 | ST. ANDREW NORTHCENTRAL | Repair sidewalks and rails on Christopher Road, Beverley Close, Dan Mare Close. |
| 2016/17 | \$4,506,881.50 | ST. CATHERINE SOUTHCENTRAL | Road Rehabilitation, construction of sidewalks and repairs to U-drain in the Homestead Division in St. Catherine. |
| 2016/17 | \$4,019,917.11 | ST. CATHERINE SOUTHEASTERN | Rehab of Waterford Community Park |
| 2016/17 | \$3,000,000.00 | ST. CATHERINE CENTRAL | Upgrading works in Spanish Town: Peace Park, Eltham Gordon Pen and Ensom beautification, Ellerslie painting of murals and Nicholson Gardens fence painting. |
| 2017/18 | \$7,050,000.00 | ST. ANDREW EAST CENTRAL | Repair fencing to football field at Dunrobin Sports Complex and installation of an irrigation system (to include pump and tank). |
| 2017/18 | \$2,998,500.00 | ST. CATHERINE EAST CENTRAL | Urban Renewal in Gregory Park (Zinc fence removal) |
| 2017/18 | \$3,020,458.24 | TRELAWNY SOUTHERN | Football field Rehabilitation and fence erection in Litchfield. |
| 2018/19 | \$4,070,000.00 | ST. ANDREW NORTHWESTERN | Maverley Community Centre & Clean and Bush Perkins Boulevard. |
| 2018/19 | \$2,000,000.00 | ST. JAMES EAST CENTRAL | Construction of Community Centre – Content. |

Source: AuGD's compilation of information from TPDCo's project documents

¹ In December 2014, TPDCo's Board of Directors approved the TIP which was originally managed by the Jamaica Emergency Employment Programme (JEEP) and is in its fourth phase.

- 3 TPDCo was up to date in its preparation of Strategic Business Plans for the five-year period under review.** The plans identified strategies, performance indicators and targets for major projects and programmes. TPDCo's priority programmes included Tourism Entity Management Systems (TEMS) community tourism programs, resort upgrading and attraction and craft development. However, it was not evident that any impact assessment was undertaken to justify project expenditures. Our review of TPDCo's and the portfolio Ministry of Tourism Strategic Business Plans showed no evidence of performance results for project implementation. As a result, we were unable to ascertain how the Board and the portfolio Ministry assessed the contribution of TPDCo's projects to the overall tourism product enhancement and whether full value was obtained for the funds spent.

Governance Arrangements

- 4 TPDCo did not faithfully adhere to its own recruitment policy when it engaged staff without the minimum qualifications.** Whereas TPDCo was compliant with its HRMD policy when it engaged 13 officers utilizing a competitive process involving advertisements and the conduct of formal interviews; however, we found that TPDCo employed and/or promoted eight employees, including five executive level staff, who did not possess the minimum education qualification for the substantive positions to which they were recruited and confirmed. TPDCo's records did not cite justification for the deviations from its recruitment policy, and hence, we could not confirm how TPDCo assured itself that the most suitable candidates were selected for the respective positions.
- 5 TPDCo has not submitted financial reports for the period spanning financial years 2018/19 to 2020/21.** We noted that since May 2016, TPDCo has been submitting Board packages to the Ministry of Tourism, which includes board minutes. However, whereas TPDCo submitted annual reports and audited financial statements to the Ministry of Tourism for the period 2014-15 to 2017-18, TPDCo is yet to submit the reports and financial statements for 2018-19 to 2020-21 (**Table 2**). TPDCo indicated that outstanding annual reports and financial statements would be completed by July 2022, to include the 2021-22 annual report. Further, the Ministry of Tourism did not conduct an annual assessment of TPDCo's Board, along with its committees, contrary to the Cabinet approved Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies, 2012².

²Each Board of a Public Body should be subject to a formal and rigorous annual appraisal of its performance and that of its committees and individual Directors.

Table 2: TPDCO Reports Obtained/Not Obtained for the period 2013-14 to 2019-20

| Report Type | Reports Required per year | Reports Obtained and Reviewed | | | | | | |
|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| | | 2019/20 | 2018/19 | 2017/18 | 2016/17 | 2015/16 | 2014/15 | 2013/14 |
| Annual Report | 1 | Drafted and awaiting Financials | Drafted and awaiting Financials | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| Financial Statements | 1 | Commenced | Awaiting Board Approval | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| | | 2020 | 2019 | 2018 | 2017 | 2016 | 2015 | 2014 |
| Quarterly Reports | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 2 |

Source: AuGD compilation of information taken from TPDCo's Financial Reports

Recommendations

- i. TPDCo should also strengthen its project management processes and fully implement the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) approved in March 2019, which requires the conduct of feasibility studies prior to board approval and project implementation.
- ii. TPDCo must immediately take steps to improve its HRA practices to ensure compliance with its HRA policy and best practice.



Part 1: Introduction

Background and Overview

1.1 The Tourism Product Development Company (TPDCo) was incorporated as a private company in 1975 and has been in operation since 1996 with a mandate to develop and improve the tourism product. National Outcome 12 of the Vision 2030 Jamaica National Development Plan, recognised the need to improve the standards and level of customer service in the tourism industry which contributed 9.2 per cent to Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in 2018 and is the third highest generator of foreign exchange for the Jamaican economy. To achieve the Government’s target for the tourism sector, there is an increased need to ensure that the physical, social, and environmental aspects of resort areas and their offerings are of a standard conducive to a great vacation experience.

1.2 The objectives of TPDCo are to:

- i. Develop plans and programmes for the improvement of resort areas;
- ii. Assist with the improvement of the infrastructure and physical environment of resort towns;
- iii. Encourage investment in tourism-related activities;
- iv. Establish, inspect, and monitor the standards of all entities operating in the tourism sector; and
- v. Create, organize, and conduct training programmes which will facilitate human development in the tourism sector.

1.3 In line with the stated mandate, TPDCo would be expected to work closely with operators of tourism-related facilities to promote the attributes of a quality product, monitoring same and engaging the Ministry of Industry and Tourism and the Jamaica Tourist Board (JTB), in a continuous effort to satisfy consumer demand and expectations.

Mission and Vision Statements

1.4 TPDCo’s mission, states, *“To facilitate the diversification, development and improvement of the tourism product, utilizing an experienced and qualified staff to enhance visitor experience by building consensus and strategic alliances with industry stakeholders in order to engender socioeconomic growth”*.

The vision is *“to strengthen the competitiveness of Jamaica’s tourism through product diversification, organizational effectiveness, socio-economic development and impact, and improved quality”*.

Organization and Staffing

1.5 TPDCo is governed by a Board of Directors composed of 15 members: ten representatives of the tourist industry, and five public interest representatives inclusive of a pilot, philanthropist, architect, and strategist. The Board is appointed by the Minister of Tourism. The directors are compensated for their service and are reimbursed for expenses, including travel expenses necessary for the performance of their duties. The Board is supported by an Audit Committee and a Finance, Audit & Risk Management, Product Quality & Training, Project, and Human Resources Committee. Despite being in operations for over 20 years, TPDCo’s Board Charter, which defines the

Board's role and responsibilities, including those related to corporate governance and code of ethics, was only approved on September 24, 2021.

1.6 TPDCo has a functional internal audit department that reports directly to the Audit and Risk Management Committee. The Internal Audit Department is guided by an Internal Audit Charter, which is a formal document that defines the internal audit scope, purpose, authority, and responsibility. The Internal Audit Charter also establishes the unit's position within the organization, including the nature of the Chief Internal Auditor's functional reporting relationship with the Board and senior management. According to TPDCo's Internal Audit Charter, its function is to review the operations of the Company and the decisions taken by Management to ensure that they are in keeping with policies, instructions and decisions taken by the Board; determine whether the operations of TPDCo are being efficiently, effectively and economically conducted in accordance with Company policy, applicable regulations, international standards, generally accepted accounting principles and sound business practices; participate in the planning, design, development and modification of new and existing systems so that controls can be prescribed before implementation as well as; conduct periodic audits of the operations of the Information Communication and Technology Department and make pre- and post installation evaluations of major data processing systems in order to determine whether these systems meet their intended purposes and objectives.

1.7 TPDCo's main source of funding is through the Government of Jamaica (GOJ). A total of \$5.7 billion was allocated to TPDCo over the period 2014-15 to 2018-19. This allocation reflected an increasing trend overall, with a 19 per cent increase in 2016-17 and a 130 per cent increase in 2017, as shown in **Table 3**. Along with the Consolidated Fund, TPDCo's major sources of funding for projects for the period 2014-15 to 2018-19, were the Tourism Enhancement Fund (TEF), income from Industry Training Programmes and Inspection Fees. In 2015-16 TPDCo obtained \$97 million from TEF, income from Industry Training Programmes and Inspection Fees via Appropriation-In-Aid. Grants from the Tourism Enhancement Fund and income from Industry Training Programmes and Inspection Fees in 2016-17 was \$279 million and in 2017-18 \$1.3 billion was granted, which substantiates the significant increase in funding for that period.

Table 3: Budgetary Allocation

| Components of Allocations | 2018-19 | 2017-18 | 2016-17 | 2015-16 | 2014-15 | Total |
|---|------------------|------------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|------------------|
| | \$'000 | \$'000 | \$'000 | \$'000 | \$'000 | \$'000 |
| Direction & Administration | 564,613 | 654,057 | 479,946 | 304,293 | 220,163 | 2,223,072 |
| Product Development | 899,510 | 722,437 | 185,750 | 124,271 | 103,740 | 2,035,708 |
| Product Quality Support | 501,691 | 575,393 | 166,499 | 65,104 | 85,966 | 1,394,653 |
| Enhancing the Resilience of the Agricultural Sector and Coastal Areas | | | 17,000 | 8,791 | 14,392 | 40,183 |
| Craft Enhancement and Business Planning Training | | | | 12,800 | 10,000 | 22,800 |
| Total Estimated Budget Amount | 1,965,814 | 1,951,887 | 849,195 | 515,259 | 434,261 | 5,716,416 |
| Percentage of Movement | 1% | 130% | 65% | 19% | | |

Source: GoJ's Estimates of Expenditure



Audit Rationale, Objective, Scope and Methodology

1.8 We conducted a performance audit to assess the extent to which TPDCo was efficiently managing its project related activities towards the achievement of the goals and objectives for the tourism sector. We sought to assess the adequacy of TPDCo's monitoring of contract compliance in respect of the initiating, planning and executing of tourism product projects, contracts and agreements for the period. We also assessed the adequacy of TPDCo's governance system to provide strategic direction and oversight of their activities. **Appendix 1** outlines the key audit questions used to achieve the audit objective.

1.9 We planned and conducted our performance audit in accordance with the Government Auditing Standards, which are applicable to Performance Audit, AuGD Performance Audit Manual (2017), as well as standards issued by the International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI). Our assessment covered the period (2014-2015 to 2019-20) and our criteria developed accordingly (**Appendix 2**). Additionally, the audit reflected specifically on three themes namely Governance, Project Management and Procurement & Contract Management, which form part of the Auditor General's strategic priorities.

The audit methodology included:








- soliciting stakeholders' view through focus group discussions.
- reviewing of documentation relating to strategies and plans.
- reviewing documentation relevant to projects.
- conducting interviews with TPDCo's senior management and staff.
- identifying and assessing TPDCo's management control framework; and
- conducting a detailed file review of projects managed by TPDCo during the period 2014 – 2019

1.10 This report was prepared in accordance with professional auditing standards and sought to inform Parliament and the public in their assessment of whether there is adequate oversight of the project management activities of TPDCo. The audit findings, conclusions and recommendations do not constitute legal opinion and should not be considered as such.

This report contains our findings on
Project Management and Governance
Arrangements at the
Tourism Product Development Company
(TPDCo).



Part 2 Projects: Programmes, Procurement and Contracts

|  | At A Glance | | |
|---|---|--|--|
| Systems and practices | Criteria | Audit Findings and Observations | Assessment Against Criteria |
| Project planning Phase | <p>The necessary due diligence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs Assessment Feasibility study, inclusive of financing plan to inform the decision to proceed with projects. | TPDCo did not always conduct feasibility studies prior to the implementation of projects. TPDCo indicated that they used the CRUP, and the Tourism Master Plan dated prior to 2009 and 2002 respectively. |  |
| Project Implementation Phase: Contract agreement | Signed contracts outlining the terms and conditions should be entered into by both parties before work commences to protect the parties' interest. | We identified 19 contracts valuing \$362.2 million for which the start dates were excluded and 18 contracts valuing \$326.2 million for which there were no completion dates. |  |
| Project Monitoring Phase: | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> System in place to capture and track information about the status of the project/programme. Mechanisms put in place to measure performance in relation to the management of the project/programme. | <p>TPDCo was not always consistent in monitoring projects. We found that 54 of 60 contracts under TIP were not being monitored.</p> <p>TPDCo was unable to provide completion certificates for our sample of 60 contracts under TIP.</p> |  |
|  |  |  | |
| Met the criteria | Met the criteria, but improvements needed | Did not meet the criteria | |

Roles and Responsibilities

2.1 TPDCO's role is to facilitate infrastructural improvements and beautification of resort areas in Jamaica. In a bid to develop and maintain the tourism product, the Projects Department is responsible for initiating, planning, executing, and monitoring projects aimed at improving the visitors' experience. At the time of our audit, the project management team consisted of the Director of Projects, eight Project Managers, two senior Project Managers, two project officers, one quantity surveyor, a draughtsman, and a technical service manager. The proper management of all components of project development and implementation is crucial to TPDCo's effectiveness in achieving its mandate and implementing its tourism strategy. However, TPDCo assessed that the number of quantity surveyors available was inadequate and it also had to engage the services of architects to do drawings and other architectural work.

Absence of feasibility study to support implementation of projects

2.2 TPDCo indicated that projects were identified through stakeholder consultation with Destination Assurance Managers, alignment of its Annual Budget to Master Plan for the Tourism Sector, request made by Local Government offices as well as site visits conducted by the Project Development Department. Nonetheless, consistent with best practice, we expected TPDCo to assess the feasibility of projects and assess risks, prior to approval and implementation, to facilitate receipt of value for money. TPDCo acknowledged that ideally, the Project Department should carry out feasibility studies, however, this was rarely done as the department lacked adequate number of staff to carry out the function. In March 2019, TPDCo implemented the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) that required management to *“develop Project Concept and carry out feasibility studies - develop Initial Budget and financial viability studies prior to detailed designs – upon receiving an approved Project Application Form,”* in deciding on a project, scope of work, justification, funding, and budget. Notwithstanding, we saw no evidence of conformity with best practice and subsequently, the SOP. For example, the Flankers project justification presented to the Board did not include the required risk assessment and cost benefit analysis of the intended projects. In justifying implementation, the submission merely stated that Jamaica’s resort towns and cities serve as central points within the tourism industry, in which and around which major tourism activity takes place.

TPDCo, by way of correspondence dated October 2021 indicated that *“conducting feasibility studies, risk assessment and cost benefit analysis are to be enforced. Instructions have been sent to all Projects Department Staff for these steps to be taken on all projects.”*

TPDCo’s Project Management was deficient

2.3 For the period 2014-15 to 2019-20, TPDCo planned the execution of 102 projects with a total budgeted value of \$9.2 billion. TPDCo’s records indicated that projects not completed in a specific year, were either carried forward to a subsequent period, placed on hold or discontinued (**Table 4**). TPDCo identified 59 projects as having been completed for the period under review. We selected 11 of the completed projects for review with a contractual value of \$478 million, as well as one program, the combined value of which was \$759 million. Further, for the eleven projects selected, project documents did not indicate the criteria used for the selection and prioritization of projects. TPDCo indicated that projects were selected by utilizing the established Master Plan for Sustainable Tourism Development, the Comprehensive Resort Upgrading Programme (CRUP), public sector entities and general stakeholder consultations. The Master Plan was intended to guide the industry over the next decade and focus on the strategic vision, marketing strategy and other aspect of the tourism industry. We identified that the Master Plan was approved in September 2002 whereas from a report dated June 2009, we noted that the CRUP documentation was only for the Negril resort area. Given that both documentations were outdated, we expected TPDCo to prioritize projects based on objective criteria, that would maximise the returns from the expenditure incurred on projects. However, we saw no evidence of impact assessments and hence, we were unable to determine how TPDCo assured itself of the achievement of value for money spent on the projects. (**Appendix 3**).

Table 4: TPDCo's Planned Projects for the Period 2014-15 to 2019-20

| No. of Planned Projects | Budgeted Amount (\$) | Completed | Brought Forward to Subsequent Period | Ongoing | On Hold | Discontinued |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------|--------------------------------------|-----------|----------|--------------|
| 17 | 1,540,289,163.80 | 5 | - | 12 | - | - |
| 13 | 1,637,918,894.13 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | |
| 23 | 1,242,130,229.46 | 17 | 5 | - | - | 1 |
| 28 | 2,538,946,567.60 | 17 | 7 | 1 | - | 3 |
| 13 | 1,259,781,345.04 | 10 | 2 | - | - | 1 |
| 8 | 944,243,496.00 | 6 | 2 | - | - | - |
| 102 | 9,163,309,696.03 | 59 | 20 | 15 | 3 | 5 |

Source: AuGD compilation of information received from TPDCo's

2.4 Based on the inadequacy of the documentation related to projects selected for audit review, alternative procedures were performed to obtain required information, where possible. However, we were unable to determine whether:

- Projects were managed effectively to ensure that it is completed on time, in budget and at the required level of quality; and
- Contractors corrected all defects identified before the final payment was made.

Tourism Improvement Programme (TIP)

2.5 In December 2014 TPDCo's Board of Directors approved the Tourism Improvement Programme, which is in its fourth phase and was originally managed by the Jamaica Emergency Employment Program (JEEP). The main objectives of TIP were to enhance the tourism product in the 63 constituencies island wide and address the following opportunities:

- Insufficient spread of the benefits of tourism to communities both in and outside the main tourist areas
- Assist in improving access to some of the areas where attractions are located
- Assist in the diversification of Jamaica's Tourism Product

2.6 TPDCo manages the Tourism Improvement Programme (TIP)³, which spans 63 constituencies and involves several municipal corporations and licensed agencies. Under TIP, each constituency was allocated \$3 million annually to undertake projects, which was subsequently increased to \$4 million during the financial year 2019-20). TPDCo's records showed that 315 contracts valued at \$1.078 billion were executed over the period 2014-15 to 2019-20. We expected TPDCo to select and prioritize projects based on established criteria that align with the company's main objective of enhancing the tourism product and offers the best value for money spent. TPDCo did not provide the concept document for the implementation of TIP or evidence of how projects were selected under the program, despite our request. Our review of TPDCo's records revealed that the TIP was

³ In December 2014, TPDCo's Board of Directors approved the TIP which was originally managed by the Jamaica Emergency Employment Programme (JEEP) and is in its fourth phase.



expected to address the insufficient spread of the benefits of tourism to communities both in and outside the main tourist areas, assist in improving access to some of the areas where attractions are located and assist in the diversification of Jamaica’s tourism product.

2.7 Of the 315 contracts executed under TIP, we selected 60 contracts valuing \$251 million for review. We noted that in some cases there was no apparent linkage between the project and the value to the tourism sector. Examples of 12 such projects are highlighted in **Table 5 below**. Further, we were unable to determine whether the 60 selected contracts were completed on time due to the absence of completion dates and actual completion certificates. In addition, to the absence of practical completion certificates, we were unable to determine whether any defects were identified and corrected within the defects-liability period. We expected TPDCo to have signed contracts with the agreed terms and conditions, as well as practical completion certificates for all contracts.

Table 5: Projects Executed Under TIP

| Year of Project | Contract Sum | Constituency | Type of Work |
|-----------------|----------------|----------------------------|--|
| 2015/16 | \$3,001,236.51 | CLARENDON NORTHCENTRAL | Construction of netball court and football field at Summerfield Community Centre |
| 2016/17 | \$3,015,000.00 | ST. ANDREW WESTERN | Rehabilitate the Duhaney Park recreational park |
| 2016/17 | \$3,001,950.00 | ST. ANDREW NORTHWESTERN | Rehabilitation of Pembroke Close Road. |
| 2016/17 | \$3,497,445.00 | ST. ANDREW NORTHCENTRAL | Repair sidewalks and rails on Christopher Road, Beverley Close, Dan Mare Close |
| 2016/17 | \$4,506,881.50 | ST. CATHERINE SOUTHCENTRAL | Road Rehabilitation, construction of sidewalks and repairs to U-drain in the Homestead Division in St. Catherine. |
| 2016/17 | \$4,019,917.11 | ST. CATHERINE SOUTHEASTERN | Rehab of Waterford Community Park |
| 2016/17 | \$3,000,000.00 | ST. CATHERINE CENTRAL | Upgrading works in Spanish Town: Peace Park, Eltham Gordon Pen and Ensom beautification, Ellerslie painting of murals and Nicholson Gardens fence painting |
| 2017/18 | \$7,050,000.00 | ST. ANDREW EAST CENTRAL | Repair fencing to football field at Dunrobin Sports Complex and installation of an irrigation system (to include pump and tank) |
| 2017/18 | \$2,998,500.00 | ST. CATHERINE EAST CENTRAL | Urban Renewal in Gregory Park (Zinc fence removal) |
| 2017/18 | \$3,020,458.24 | TRELAWNY SOUTHERN | Football field Rehabilitation and fence erection in Litchfield |
| 2018/19 | \$4,070,000.00 | ST. ANDREW NORTHWESTERN | Maverley Community Centre & Clean and Bush Perkins Boulevard |
| 2018/19 | \$2,000,000.00 | ST. JAMES EAST CENTRAL | Construction of Community Centre – Content |

Source: AuGD compilation of information from TPDCo’s project documents

2.8 Our review of the contracts further revealed that TPDCo was not adequately monitoring its contracts. Of the 60 total number of contracts selected for review, TPDCo only provided monitoring reports, which are deemed satisfactory, for 6 contracts valued at \$30 million (**Table 6**). These reports highlighted the status of each stage of the contract life. In addition to the 6 satisfactory monitoring reports, TPDCO provided 34 images of contracts undertaken. However, these pictorials were considered inconclusive as there was no indication of the contract to which they relate.

Table 6: Monitoring Reports Obtained from TPDCo

| Financial Year | Partnering With | Contract Sum (\$) | Constituency | Type of Work | Site Assessment Report |
|----------------|------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|---|------------------------|
| 2017/18 | SDF | 7,050,000.00 | ST. ANDREW EAST CENTRAL | Repair fencing to football field at Dunrobin Sports Complex and installation of an irrigation system (to include pump and tank) | Seen |
| 2018/19 | Manchester MC | 3,000,690.00 | MANCHESTER NORTHEASTERN | Beautification Works and Installation of chain-link fencing to Chantilly Primary School Robins Hall Primary, Golden Run Basic School, Saw Mill Basic School | Seen |
| 2018/19 | Manchester MC | 3,000,296.00 | MANCHESTER CENTRAL | Upgrade Bellefield Town Center Parkette Construction of Restrooms at New Hall Playfield | Seen |
| 2018/19 | NWA | 4,500,203.63 | PORTLAND WESTERN | Road Patching - Buff Bay Valley and Wakesfield | Seen |
| 2019/20 | Clarendon MC | 9,099,828.13 | CLARENDON | Beautification Works to Lionel Town, et al | Seen |
| 2019/20 | TPDCo/Contractor No.18 | 3,140,799.62 | ST. ANDREW | Construction of Computer Centre at Lawrence Tavern Community Centre | Seen |
| Total | | \$29,791,817.38 | | | |

Source: AuGD compilation of information obtained from TPDCo's Monitoring Reports

Procurement and Contracts Management












2.10 We expected TPDCo to adhere to the GOJ procurement guidelines and where applicable utilize competitive bidding methodology which facilitates transparency and the opportunity to obtain quality goods and services at the best price. There was no evidence that the GOJ procurement guidelines were utilized for the procurement of a contract with the Sports Development Foundation (SDF) under the rehabilitation of the Barrett Town Community Centre project. As a result, we were unable to determine if the appropriate procurement methodology was utilized, whether competitive bidding was incorporated and the proper approvals given, based on the guidelines stipulated in the procurement handbook.

Page **21** of **44**

Monitoring and Evaluation of Projects

2.11 We expected TPDCo contracts to include start and completion date. However, the start date for works was not included in 19 contracts valuing \$362.2 million and completion date were not included in 18 contracts valuing \$326.2 million (**Appendix 5 & 6 respectively**). The date of the agreement was also not included in 14 contracts valuing \$285.8 million (**Appendix 7**). TPDCo issued a 'position of site letter' upon endorsement of contracts to the contractors. This letter informed contractors of possession of site date, start date and duration of contract. However, this letter was not issued in 18 instances for contracts valuing \$368.2 million. With these gaps identified, we were unable to ascertain when these contracts started and when they were completed. Given the absence of a start and completion date, we were unable to determine whether the contract experienced time overrun, which would have impacted on the cost effectiveness.

Part 3 Corporate Management Practices

|  At A Glance | | | |
|---|---|---|--|
| Systems and practices | Criteria | Key Findings | Assessment Against Criteria |
| Strategic planning processes | TPDCo has a framework to define its strategic plan and objectives. | <p>The required strategic and operational plans to guide tourism [core] activities were not consistently prepared and were not adjusted on an annual rolling basis.</p> <p>TPDCo had a comprehensive strategic planning process, including a periodic strategic planning exercise, with the participation of the Board.</p> <p>TPDCo established measurable strategic objectives, which were aligned with the mandate and identified accountabilities for the implementation of its Corporate Plan.</p> |    |
| Board oversight | The Board carried out its oversight role over the Company. | <p>The Board structure reflected the nature of the Company's business and responsibilities.</p> <p>The Board established sub-committees in areas such as Human Resource, Finance, Audit and Risk Management. However, there was no evidence of a risk framework to identify potential threats and risks to TPDCo's operations.</p> <p>The Ministry of Tourism did not periodically evaluate its performance and the performance of its committees.</p> |    |
| Performance measurement, monitoring and reporting | TPDCo established performance measures in support of achieving strategic objectives; thereafter monitored and report on progress in achieving these objectives on a timely basis. | <p>There was evidence of performance indicators to measure project management activities. However, no assessments were conducted to determine the impact of its project expenditure on the overall tourism sector.</p> <p>TPDCo reported on its performance internally to senior management and the Board, and externally through its annual report. However, TPDCO was inconsistent in its preparation of the annual reports in a timely manner.</p> |  |
|  Met the criteria | |  Met the criteria, but improvements needed |  Did not meet the criteria |

Oversight and Strategic Direction

3.1 TPDCo's current governance and accountability practices were assessed to determine conformity with the PBMA Act and policies as well as its own policy and procedures. Despite TPDCo's Board being in operation for over 20 years, its Board Charter was only approved on September 24, 2021. The Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies in Jamaica (revised 2012)] stipulates that *"each Board must have a Charter, which defines the roles and responsibilities of the Board including its responsibilities for corporate governance and its code of ethics."* The framework document also requires that *on first appointment, and at any time when circumstances dictate, all directors should, in good faith, disclose to the Board, for recording and disclosure to external auditors, any business or other interests that are likely to create a potential conflict of interest.*

Board Performance and Evaluation

3.2 Under the regulation of the Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies, 2012, the Board, along with its committees, should be assessed annually⁴. However, the Ministry of Tourism did not conduct an annual assessment of TPDCo's Board, along with its committees, contrary to the Cabinet approved Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies, 2012. We found that whereas the Ministry of Tourism received quarterly, half-yearly and annual reports from TPDCo, these reports were not presented to the Permanent Secretary within the stipulated time.

The Ministry of Tourism in response dated January 19, 2022, indicated, "Although the Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies in Jamaica was revised in October 2012, the Board Performance Instrument was not yet available. Reference is made to letter dated September 4, 2020, from the Ministry of Finance and the Public Service (MoF&PS) in which the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Tourism (MT) was advised that, by way of Cabinet Decision 37/20, dated 27th July 2020, approval was granted for the Revised Board Performance Evaluation Instrument (BPEI) developed for use by boards of public bodies. The letter further stated that phase two of the roll out was set to begin April 2021. The MOF&PS promised a sensitization session to better prepare public bodies for implementation of the instrument. The sensitization for public bodies under MT was done on November 17, 2021."

"Based on the foregoing, using the Board Committee and Corporate Sensitization Performance Evaluation Instrument provided by the MoF&PS, the Board's performance evaluation for public bodies under the purview of the MT will be done at the end of the Fiscal Year 2021/2022."

3.3 With the advent of global pandemic, COVID 19, our review of official documents, including Board Minutes, revealed plans and discussions related to the adjustment to TPDCo strategic and operational direction to respond to the disruptions in the tourism market due to the COVID 19 pandemic. These included the development of post COVID 19 protocols that would govern operations of all tourism entities, the establishment of destination centres, where destination assurance managers were required to identify and advocate for individuals/entities. At the time

⁴Each Board of a Public Body should be subject to a formal and rigorous annual appraisal of its performance and that of its committees and individual Directors.

of the audit, TPDCo was still in the process of preparing a Risk Register and a Draft Risk Policy which was slated to be completed on July 31, 2020.

3.4 TPDCo reported its performance against several objectives that were broadly aligned to performance targets in its 2014-2017 strategic business plan. The performance indicators that TPDCo reported against were a combination of activities and outputs. However, our review of TPDCo's and the portfolio Ministry of Tourism and Entertainment Strategic Business Plans showed no evidence of assessments to measure the impact of its project expenditure. As a result, we were unable to determine how the Board and the portfolio Ministry determined the extent to which TPDCo's project expenditure contributed to overall tourism product enhancement and whether full value was obtained for the funds spent.

Strategic Monitoring, and Reporting

3.5 Given that the Executive Director (ED) is accountable to the Board of Directors for the management and performance of the Company, we expected TPDCO's Board to monitor the executive director's performance. TPDCo provided evidence of a formal performance evaluation report on agreed activities by the Board. We also noted that all senior managers were duly evaluated, in keeping with good corporate governance practice.

Reporting on its performance

3.6 Since May 2016, TPDCo has been submitting board packages to the Permanent Secretary which includes board meeting minutes. However, we found that over the six-year period 2014-15 to 2019-20, TPDCo did not faithfully submit annual reports to the portfolio minister for tabling and there was no evidence that the portfolio Ministry requested submission of the reports. TPDCo is yet to submit audited financial statements and annual reports for the period 2018-19 to present. Over the six-year period 2014-15 to 2019-20, TPDCo presented four annual reports and financial statements to the Ministry of Tourism for the period 2014-15 and 2017-18, but these were not submitted to the Ministry of Tourism until January 2021, approximately 3-4 years after the expected date. TPDCo indicated that remaining annual reports and financial statements for 2018-19 to 2020-21 would be completed by July 2022, to include the 2021-22 annual report. The Board's failure to ensure timely preparation and consistently submit, annual reports and the audited financial statements to the Minister for tabling, would have limited Parliament's and the portfolio Ministry's oversight of TPDCo's operational and financial performance. Further, The Ministry of Tourism did not conduct an annual assessment of TPDCo's Board, along with its committees, contrary to the Cabinet approved Corporate Governance Framework for Public Bodies, 2012⁵.

3.7 Since publishing its 2015-16 annual report, in September 2019, there has been no other reporting by TPDCo of its activities via an annual report. The PBMA Act 2016 mandates that the annual reports be laid in Parliament within four months after respective financial year ended. TPDCo's submissions exceeded the stipulated timeframe with periods ranging from 10 months in 2014-15, 37 months in 2015-16. TPDCo's failure to consistently prepare and submit to the Minister, annual reports and the audited financial statements for tabling in the House of

⁵Each Board of a Public Body should be subject to a formal and rigorous annual appraisal of its performance and that of its committees and individual Directors.

Representative, limited Parliament's and the portfolio ministry's oversight responsibilities for TPDCo's operational and financial performance.

Human Resource Management and Practices

3.8 We identified issues related to the recruiting of employees and the inclusion of pertinent recruitment documents on employees' files. TPDCo engaged staff without the minimum qualifications, in breach of its recruitment policy. We expected that staff would be engaged through a transparent selection process to determine the best applicant with the appropriate work experience and minimum qualification. However, we found no evidence that TPDCo engaged a transparent process for the selection of 11 of the 24 executive level staff including senior positions such as the (then) Executive Director, contrary to TPDCo's own Human Resource Management and Development Policy Manual, which stipulates: *"Selective use of psychometric evaluations, simulation assessments and other appropriate testing, as well as a panel interview may be used in search of the best available talent"* (**Appendix 8**). TPDCo's records did not cite justification for this deviation from HR policy.

3.9 TPDCo is yet to present evidence of the selection process for 8 of the 24 officers promoted and advertisements for 3 of the posts recruited. TPDCo indicated that promotion for eight of these officers, who were assigned to act in the position, was facilitated in accordance with dictates of Section 22.2 of its employee's Manual and Performance Management System. For instance, the Office of the Services Commission (OSC) allows for qualified persons, to be selected to a position without competition, in special circumstances which requires all employees to be advised via internal memorandum to allow interested person to appeal the decision⁶. TPDCo's Employee Manual stated that once an employee possesses the necessary skills, knowledge, and ability to perform the job, he or she would be given the opportunity for promotion.

Section 22.2:

- a. TPDCo places a high premium on the development of its employees and the shaping of career paths best suited to the employee's ability, interest, and potential.
- b. Each Supervisor shall ensure that employees under their direction receive the training and experience necessary for their advancement. Directors/Managers shall ensure that in the event an employee leaves the company, his/her place can at least be temporarily filled by a member of staff.
- c. Once the employee possesses the necessary skills, knowledge, and ability to perform the job, he/she will be given the opportunity for promotion. To achieve this, TPDCo shall encourage and contribute to the training, development, and advancement of staff where possible.
- d. Promotions will be based primarily on performance and ability, and not singularly on an employee's length of service.
- e. Promotions result in an automatic review of salary and other benefits.

⁶ Office of the Services Commission - RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION PROCEDURES MANUAL For Ministries, Departments and Executive Agencies 6.2.1. Competitive vs. Non-Competitive Selection However, Permanent Secretaries, Heads of Departments or Chief Executive Officers may, in exceptional circumstances, make a case to select someone for a post without competition. This should only take place, for example, where the talent pool is limited and known, or where the decision relates to the training and development strategy in the Human Resource Management Plan. In such cases, the selection decision should be posted via an internal memorandum to all employees/the Intranet, so that anyone who may have had an interest may appeal the decision.

3.10 Also, TPDCo engaged another eight employees, including five executive level staff, with annual emoluments totalling \$31.3 million, who did not possess the minimum education qualification for the substantive positions for which they were recruited, and did not present any evidence of other criteria being applied (**Appendix 9**). The AuGD recognises that persons can act in positions including those for which they do not possess the requisite qualification; however, to be appointed in the position on a permanent basis, the employee should be selected on a competitive basis and possess the required qualification.

TPDCo in its response dated October 2021 indicated, “We have several instances wherein capable and experienced team members were assigned to act in senior roles which were vacant, as is permitted by the TPDCo Personnel Policy Manual. The process of identifying said persons is done justly based on seniority of tenure, the team member’s capabilities, track record of exceeding objectives and knowledge of the role. The team members, in some cases, were assigned to the position after carrying out the duties efficiently and after mastering the learning curve.

TPDCo further indicated that one of the affected employees subsequently completed a master’s degree in July 2021, while three are currently pursuing bachelor’s degrees to meet the eligibility criteria and the status of the remaining four status remained unchanged.

3.11 We found that some of the roles and responsibilities assigned to Destination Assurance Managers overlapped with those of Project Managers which presents a risk that tasks would remain undone/neglected as the accountable officer was not clearly identified (**Table 7**).

Table 7: Destination and Project Managers Overlapping Roles

| Destination Manager’s Role | Project Manager’s Role |
|--|---|
| Provide Project Management coordination and support to implementation of all projects and programmes undertaken in the resort area | Planning, managing and implementation of all current projects as well as to develop, plan, manage and implement proposed new projects |

Source: Information obtained from TPDCo’s Job Descriptions



Appendices

Appendix 1: Audit Questions

Key Question: Is TPDCo efficiently managing its project management activities towards the achievement of the goals and objectives for the tourism sector?

| Level two Questions | Level three questions that underpin this |
|--|--|
| 1. Is there an effective governance framework to support the development of the tourism product? | 1.1 Is TPDCO exercising the required oversight among coordinating agencies that execute activities to enhance the tourism product? |
| | 1.2 Is TPDCO subjected to proper oversight by its parent ministry to ensure enhancement of the tourism product? |
| | 1.3 Does TPDCO have effective strategies and the appropriate structure in place to achieve its intended outcomes? |
| 2. Does TPDCo have an effective mechanism to monitor the projects throughout its lifecycle? | 2.1 Has TDPCO exercised adequate due diligence including feasibility studies prior to project approval? |
| | 2.2 Are projects efficiently managed to achieve its intended outcome? |

Appendix 2: Audit Criteria and Source

| Question | Criteria | Source |
|--|--|---|
| Is TPDCO exercising the required oversight among coordinating agencies that execute activities to enhance the tourism product? | We expect TPDCO to clearly define the tourism product and conduct risk assessments and SWOT analyses (particularly key threats) | Risk Assessment Evaluation Reports |
| Is TPDCO subjected to proper oversight by its parent ministry to ensure enhancement of the tourism product? | TPDCO should measure its operational (annual report) and financial (AFS) performance against agreed upon plans and targets (KPIs) and publish the results as soon as possible after the end of each financial year, but not more than four months thereafter, shall submit the annual report including audited financial statements to the responsible Minister. | Correspondence and submissions to the Ministry and Tourism from TPDCO, Approved strategic and corporate plans. |
| Does TPDCO have effective strategies and the appropriate structure in place to achieve its intended outcomes? | TPDCO should have the appropriate staffing structure to enable proper governance of its operations. | Organizational Structure, Staff Establishment and Payroll Register |
| Has TDPCO exercised adequate due diligence including feasibility studies prior to project approval? | TPDCO should have a framework for the planning process, which should ensure that its' budgets and project plans are aimed at achieving the intended outcomes. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project Charter indicating the rationale as to why projects were implemented and the expected achievement of projects. • Feasibility studies/reports. • Project risk assessment. • Project management plan. • Project documents indicating justification and approval of selected projects. • Cost benefit analysis. |
| Are projects efficiently managed to achieve its intended outcome? | TPDCO should have mechanisms in place to ensure that its defined outcomes can be achieved. | Project management plan and Annual Approved Budget/Funding Agreement(s) |

Appendix 3: Contracts Executed under 11 Projects without Risk Assessments and Criteria

| Name of Project | Contractor | Contract Detail | Contract Sum (\$) | |
|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|---------------|
| Montego Bay Eastern Entrance | Consultant No. 1 | Land Surveying Services | 897,975.00 | |
| | NSWMA | Landscaping to the Eastern Entrance to the city of Montego Bay | 22,465,190.00 | |
| | National Works Agency | Rehabilitation of Roadways- Montego Bay Eastern Entrance | 29,857,625.28 | |
| | National Works Agency | Follow On Contract for infrastructure upgrade-creation of Eastern entrance to the city of Montego Bay-Elegant Corridor, St James | 21,588,670.15 | |
| | National Works Agency | Follow-On contract for the patching of roadways in the community of Lilliput. | 4,438,317.51 | |
| | St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Success Craft Market, Lilliput and Barrett Hall | 28,681,897.50 | |
| | St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Refugee Temple, Greenwood Stoplight, Suga Pepper Restaurant and Iberostar | 28,972,916.25 | |
| | St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Rose Hall Deluxe, Grange Pen, Original Jellyman, Greenwood, Long Bay (Parish Marker) | 29,715,432.19 | |
| | St. James Municipal | Construction of walls and sign bases- Success Craft Market, Barrett Hall and Lilliput | 6,072,944.22 | |
| | St. James Municipal | Entry Marker | 2,787,253.89 | |
| | Consultant No. 2 | The provision of landscape architectural services along elegant corridor in Montego Bay | 903,200.00 | |
| | National Solid Waste Management Authority | Highway Planting along Elegant Corridor | 29,998,526.00 | |
| | National Solid Waste Management Authority | Proposed landscaping- Additional Planting along Elegant Corridor, St. James (Success to Montego Bay Airport Roundabout) | 22,357,525.00 | |
| | Flankers Sports and Vending Complex Phase 1 | St. James Municipal | Flankers Vending and sports complex- Phase 1 upgrade | 16,435,109.25 |
| | Flankers Sports and Vending Complex | St. James Municipal | Flankers Vending and sports complex- Phase 2 upgrade- execute the construction of multipurpose court, chain-link fencing, foot-path bridge and landscaping to Flankers Vending and Sports Complex. | 17,844,544.64 |

| | | | |
|------------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Negril Mini Stadium Phase 1 | Contractor No. 1 | Perimeter wall construction | 16,736,698.00 |
| | Contractor No. 2 | Stadium Seating Pavilion & Restroom | 15,634,516.00 |
| Negril Mini Stadium Phase 2 | Contractor No. 3 | Construction of spectator seating pavilion, erection of external perimeter lighting and construction of parking lot and walkway | 36,846,015.46 |
| | Consultant No. 3 | To provide design and consultation for an irrigation system at Negril Mini Stadium Phase 2 | 1,485,000.00 |
| | Westmoreland Municipal | Rehabilitation of the football field at Negril Mini-Stadium-Ph2 | 15,686,182.35 |
| | Consultant No. 4 | Perimeter lighting electrical design and consultancy for Negril Mini Stadium football field | 1,459,820.00 |
| Rafters Rest | Contractor No. 4 | Proposed rafters loading dock at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande, Portland | 5,066,961.00 |
| | Contractor No. 5 | Proposed Concrete roof to main office building at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande Portland | 4,294,920.00 |
| | Contractor No. 6 | Berrydale renovation | 1,632,840.00 |
| | Contractor No. 7 | Construction of New Sewage System at Rafter's Rest, Portland | 17,796,500 |
| | Contractor No. 8 | Engineering design- Berrydale renovation | 1,500,000.00 |
| | Contractor No. 9. | Renovation of offices at Rio, Grande, Rafter's Rest, Portland | 5,375,741.00 |
| | The Barret Town Community Centre | Sports Development Foundation | Rehabilitation of the Barrett Town Community Centre |
| | Contractor No. 10 | Construction of a retaining wall | 799,370.00 |
| Marking Stone Beach | Contractor No. 11. | Rehabilitation and upgrading of the marking stone beach, Annotto Bay St. Mary | 28,129,422.00 |
| Lyssons Beach | Contractor No. 12 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of Lyssons Beach, St. Thomas | 30,460,002.00 |
| | Contractor No.13 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of the Lyssons Beach, St. Thomas- alteration and construction of perimeter fence, construction of driveway, fabrication of benches, termite treatment and landscaping. | 11,924,250 |
| | Contractor No.14 | To carry out additional work at Lyssons Beach | 1,989,850.00 |
| Total | | | 478,320,968.69 |

Appendix 4: Contracts Executed under TIP without evidence of Risk Assessments and Criteria

| Name of Project | Contractor | Contract Detail | Contract Sum (\$) |
|---------------------------------------|----------------|--|----------------------|
| TIP 2015/16 KINGSTON CENTRAL | KSAMC | Rae Town vending kiosks. | 3,254,900.00 |
| TIP2015/16 ST. ANDREW WEST CENTRAL | KSAMC | Bushing works and gully cleaning | 7,030,000.00 |
| TIP2015/16 ST. ANDREW NORTHEASTERN | TPDCo | Road Improvement works to Jacks Hill Main Road and Landscaping work to lookout | 3,056,827.35 |
| TIP2015/16 ST. ANDREW WEST RURAL | SDC | Bushing and signage for Straun Castle, Boon Hall, Langley Great House | 3,000,000.00 |
| TIP2015/16 ST. CATHERINE SOUTHWESTERN | RADA | Upgrading Marine Terminal Beach | 3,002,525.40 |
| TIP2015/16 ST. CATHERINE NORTHEASTERN | SDC | Refurbish sections of Guys Hill Community Centre and construction of restrooms | 4,967,100.00 |
| TIP2015/16 CLARENDON NORTHERN | PARISH COUNCIL | Upgrading of entrance ways at Bull hill, Brandon Hill etc. | 3,323,500.00 |
| TIP2015/16 CLARENDON NORTH CENTRAL | PARISH COUNCIL | Construction of netball court and football field @ Summerfield Comm. Centre | 3,001,236.51 |
| TIP2015/16 CLARENDON SOUTHEASTERN | PARISH COUNCIL | 19 Mile Road intersection - Road Repairs | 3,006,304.00 |
| TIP2015/16 MANCHESTER CENTRAL | PARISH COUNCIL | Upgrading works Belretiro Square, Horse Shoe Corner, Grey Ground, Hope Village and New Green | 3,000,002.00 |
| TIP2015/16 ST. ELIZABETH SOUTHEASTERN | PARISH COUNCIL | Chocolate Hole Rd | 3,001,040.00 |
| TIP2015/16 HANOVER EASTERN | PARISH COUNCIL | Old Steamer Beach Bushing and Flower Hill Parochial Rd | 4,499,950.00 |
| TIP2016/17 KINGSTON WESTERN | KSAMC | Bathroom Upgrade-Greenwich Street and construction of sidewalk; construction of block wall | 3,950,375.00 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. ANDREW WEST CENTRAL | KSAMC | Silting and white washing of curb walls: Victory terrace, Welcome Ave, Picketts | 2,045,784.00 |

| | | | |
|---|--------------------------------|--|---------------|
| | | Crescent, Sunrise Drive, Sterling Ave, Faith Lane | |
| TIP2016/17 ST. ANDREW WESTERN | KSAMC | Rehabilitate the Duhaney Park recreational park | 3,015,000.00 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. ANDREW SOUTHERN | KSAMC | Construction of a commercial space to spearhead enterprise; signage | 3,400,000.00 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. ANDREW EAST RURAL | NONE SEEN | Façade Improvement: Redlight District; construction of bathroom | 3,250,103.86 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. ANDREW NORTHWESTERN | KSAMC | Rehabilitation of Pembroke Close Road. | 3,001,950.00 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. ANDREW NORTH CENTRAL | KSAMC | Repair sidewalks and rails on Christopher Road, Beverley Close, Dan Mare Close | 3,497,445.00 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. CATHERINE SOUTH CENTRAL | St. Catherine Parish Council | Road Rehabilitation, construction of sidewalks and repairs to U-drain in the Homestead Division in St. Catherine. | 4,506,881.50 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. CATHERINE SOUTHEASTERN | NSWMA | Rehab of Waterford Community Park | 4,019,917.11 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. CATHERINE CENTRAL | NSWMA | Upgrading works in Spanish Town: Peace Park, Eltham Gordon Pen and Ensom beautification, Ellerslie painting of murals and Nicholson Gardens fence painting | 3,000,000.00 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. CATHERINE NORTH CENTRAL | St Catherine Municipal Council | Zinc Fence Removal - roadway leading to the GC. Foster College | 3,399,738.45 |
| TIP2016/17 ST. CATHERINE SOUTHWESTERN | RADA | Construction of U-Drain at Marine Terminal Beach, Old Harbor Bay | 2,899,655.65 |
| TIP2017/18 KINGSTON CENTRAL | SDC | Upgrading works at the Rae Town Fishing beach -Livity Project | 3,097,151.96 |
| TIP2017/18 ST. ANDREW WEST CENTRAL | KSAMC | Construction of sidewalks at Cling Cling Avenue | 10,022,500.00 |
| TIP2017/18 ST. ANDREW EAST CENTRAL | SDF | Repair fencing to football field at Dunrobin Sports Complex and installation of an irrigation system (to include pump and tank) | 7,050,000.00 |
| TIP2017/18 ST. CATHERINE EAST CENTRAL | SDC | Urban Renewal in Gregory Park (Zinc fence removal) | 2,998,500.00 |
| TIP2017/18 ST. CATHERINE WEST CENTRAL | SDC & Contractor No.15 | Develop trail, story board and signage at St. John's Anglican Church | 3,579,050.00 |

| | | | |
|---|--------------------------|--|--------------|
| TIP2017/18 CLARENDON NORTHERN | Clarendon MC | Construction of Restroom & Gazebo at Bull Head | 5,000,050.00 |
| TIP2017/18 MANCHESTER SOUTHERN | Manchester MC | Continue renovations to Liberty Hall, Beautification works from Old England to Roxborough and construct a drain at Alligator Pond | 3,000,499.00 |
| TIP2017/18 MANCHESTER NORTHEASTERN | Manchester MC | Beautification works within the constituency for 2 mil • \$300,000 to the Craig Head Division • \$400,000 to the Walderston Division • \$1,300,000 to beautify the town of Christiana and 5 million for road repairs | 7,000,000.00 |
| TIP2017/18 TRELAWNY NORTHERN | TMC | Beautification Works in Falmouth | 3,000,000.00 |
| TIP2017/18 TRELAWNY SOUTHERN | TPDCo & Contractor No.16 | Football field Rehabilitation and fence erection in Litchfield | 3,020,458.24 |
| TIP2017/18 ST. JAMES EAST CENTRAL | NSWMA | General clean up in Montego Bay St. James | 3,400,000.00 |
| TIP2017/18 ST. ANN SOUTHEASTERN | St Ann MC | Alderton Rest Stop | - |
| TIP2018/19 ST. ANDREW WEST CENTRAL | KSAMC | Painting of Curb walls Painting of Murals construction of a footbridge | 6,000,977.06 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. ANDREW SOUTHWESTERN | SDC & KSAMC | - Southwest Sports Programme - Marching Band - 1907 Earthquake Monument | 1,000,020.00 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. ANDREW EAST CENTRAL | TPDCo | Upgrade to the Cassia Park Community Centre. Team Jamaica Training - Kingston Training Unit Craft Skills Training - Kingston Craft Unit | 5,876,777.00 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. ANDREW NORTHEASTERN | KSAMC | Sidewalk Repairs and Erection of Street Signs | 5,996,550.00 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. ANDREW NORTHWESTERN | KSAMC & NSWMA | Marverly Community Centre & Clean and Bush Perkins Boulevard | 4,070,000.00 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. CATHERINE NORTH CENTRAL | JCDC | Festival: Emancifest 2018 | 8,000,000.00 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. CATHERINE EAST CENTRAL | SDC & Contractor No.17 | Mini Parks in: Christian Gardens | 2,587,830.75 |

| | | | |
|--|---------------------------------------|---|--------------|
| | | Portmore Villas West Cumberland Cedar Manor | |
| TIP2018/19CLARENDON NORTHWESTERN | Clarendon Municipal Corporation | Construction of Resource and Homework Centre, Frank field | 6,000,000.00 |
| TIP2018/19MANCHESTER NORTHEASTERN | Manchester MC | Beautification Works and Installation of chain link fencing to Chantilly Primary School Robins Hall Primary, Golden Run Basic School, Saw Mill Basic School | 3,000,690.00 |
| TIP2018/19MANCHESTER CENTRAL | Manchester MC | Upgrade Bellfield Town Center Parkette Construction of Restrooms at New Hall Playfield | 3,000,296.00 |
| TIP2018/19PORTLAND WESTERN | NWA | Road Patching - Buff Bay Valley and Wakefield | 4,500,203.63 |
| TIP2018/19 ST. JAMES EAST CENTRAL | TPDCo | Construction of Community Centre Content | 2,000,000.00 |
| TIP2019/20KINGSTON | KSAMC | Beautification work for several parkette | 5,000,250.00 |
| TIP2019/20ST. ANDREW | KSAMC | Painting of curb wall& bushing within constituency: white wing walk, Pelican Parade, Simon Taylor Rd, Olympic Way, McKinley Crescent, Tamarind Turn & Allamanda Avenue; Olive Rd & Poinciana Rd | 8,000,475.00 |
| TIP2019/20ST. ANDREW | TPDCo | Painting of Arnett Garden Stadium The iconic Ambassador Theatre in Trench Town | 5,349,667.87 |
| TIP2019/20CLARENDON | Clarendon MC | Construction of Spaulding Cultural Center Phase 1 | 8,000,242.10 |
| TIP2019/20CLARENDON | Clarendon MC | Beautification Works to Lionel Town, Et al | 9,099,828.13 |
| TIP2019/20ST. ANDREW | SDF | Construction of Grandstand, JASICERA Park | 3,677,906.40 |
| TIP2019/20ST. ANDREW | TPDCo & Contractor No.18 | Construction of Computer Centre at Lawrence Tavern Community Centre | 3,140,799.62 |
| TIP2019/20ST. ANDREW | TPDCo | Construction of Vending Stalls, Constant Spring Primary School | 1,495,860.00 |

| | | | |
|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| TIP2019/20ST. CATHERINE | JCDC | Sligoville Emancipation Festival | 8,000,000.00 |
| TIP2019/20ST. CATHERINE | Contractor No.19 & NWA | Construction of Community Centre & Morris Meadows Community Park & Road Rehab Fernando Road & Nelva Court | 4,398,439.60 |
| TIP2019/20ST. CATHERINE | Contractor No 19 & Contractor 20 | Marketing of Kitson Town Heritage Trail & Construct walkway, foot path & fence at Kitson Trail | 3,341,200.00 |
| TIP2019/20ST. CATHERINE | Portmore MC | Renovate the Health and Wellness Park at the Bridgeport Community Recreational Space | 3,966,000.00 |
| Total | | | 250,802,458.19 |

Appendix 5: Contracts with no Start Date

| Contracts | Contract Detail | Contract Sum |
|--|--|-----------------------|
| NSWMA | Landscaping to the Eastern Entrance to the city of Montego Bay | 22,465,190.00 |
| National Works Agency | Rehabilitation of Roadways- Montego Bay Eastern Entrance | 29,857,625.28 |
| National Works Agency | Follow-On Contract for infrastructure upgrade-creation of Eastern Entrance to the city of Montego Bay-Elegant Corridor, St James | 21,588,670.15 |
| National Works Agency | Follow-On contract for the patching of roadways in the community of Lilliput. | 4,438,317.51 |
| St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Success Craft Market, Lilliput and Barrett Hall | 28,681,897.50 |
| St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Refugee Temple, Greenwood Stoplight, Suga Pepper Restaurant and Iberostar | 28,972,916.25 |
| St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Rose Hall Deluxe, Grange Pen, Greenwood, Long Bay | 29,715,432.19 |
| St. James Municipal | Construction of walls and sign bases as the Success Craft Market, Barrett Hall and Lilliput entrances carried out | 6,072,944.22 |
| St. James Municipal | Entry Marker | 2,787,253.89 |
| National Solid Waste Management Authority | Highway planting along Elegant Corridor | 29,998,526.00 |
| National Solid Waste Management Authority | Proposed landscaping- Additional Planting along Elegant Corridor, St. James (Success to Montego Bay Airport Roundabout) | 22,357,525.00 |
| St. James Municipal | Flankers Vending and sports complex- Phase 1 upgrade | 16,435,109.25 |
| Contractor No.1 | Perimeter wall construction | 16,736,698.00 |
| Westmoreland Municipal | Rehabilitation of the football field at Negril Mini-Stadium-Ph2 | 15,686,182.35 |
| Contractor No.4 | Proposed rafters loading dock at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande, Portland. | 5,066,961.00 |
| Contractor No.5 | Proposed Concrete roof to main office building at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande Portland | 4,294,920.00 |
| Sports Development Foundation | Rehabilitation of the Barrett Town Community Centre | 18,485,754.00 |
| Contractor No.11 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of the marking stone beach, Annotto Bay St. Mary | 28,129,422.00 |
| Contractor No.12 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of Lyssons Beach | 30,460,002.00 |
| Total | | 362,231,346.59 |

Appendix 6: Contracts with no Completion Date

| Name | Contract Detail | Contract Sum (\$) |
|--------------------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| NSWMA | Landscaping to the Eastern Entrance to the city of Montego Bay | 22,465,190.00 |
| National Works Agency | Rehabilitation of Roadways- Montego Bay Eastern Entrance | 29,857,625.28 |
| National Works Agency | Follow-On contract for the patching of roadways in the community of Lilliput. | 4,438,317.51 |
| St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Success Craft Market, Lilliput and Barrett Hall | 28,681,897.50 |
| St. James Municipal | Flankers Vending and sports complex- Phase 1 upgrade | 16,435,109.25 |
| St. James Municipal | Phase 2 upgrade- execute the construction of multipurpose court, chain-link fencing, foot-path bridge and landscaping to Flankers Vending and Sports Complex. | 17,844,544.64 |
| Contractor No.1 | Perimeter wall construction | 16,736,698.00 |
| Contractor No.2 | Stadium Seating Pavilion & Restroom | 15,634,516.00 |
| Contractor No.3 | Construction of spectator seating pavilion, erection of external perimeter lighting and construction of parking lot and walkway. | 36,846,015.46 |
| Westmoreland Municipal | Rehabilitation of the football field at Negril Mini-Stadium- Phase 2 | 15,686,182.35 |
| Contractor No.4 | Proposed rafters loading dock at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande, Portland. | 5,066,961.00 |
| Contractor No.5 | Proposed Concrete roof to main office building at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande Portland | 4,294,920.00 |
| Contractor No.7 | Construction of Sewage System at Rafter's Rest, Portland | 17,796,500.00 |
| Contractor No.9 | Renovation of offices at Rio, Grande, Rafter's Rest, Portland | 5,375,741.00 |
| Sports Development Foundation | Rehabilitation of the Barrett Town Community Centre | 18,485,754.00 |
| Contractor No.11 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of the marking stone beach, Annotto Bay St. Mary | 28,129,422.00 |
| Contractor No.12 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of Lyssons Beach | 30,460,002.00 |
| Contractor No.13 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of the Lyssons Beach, St. Thomas- alteration and construction of perimeter fence, construction of driveway, fabrication of benches, termite treatment and landscaping. | 11,924,250.00 |
| Total | | 326,159,645.99 |

Appendix 7: Contracts with no Agreement Date

| Contract | Contract Detail | Contract Sum (\$) |
|---|---|-----------------------|
| National Works Agency | Rehabilitation of Roadways- Montego Bay Eastern Entrance | 29,857,625.28 |
| National Works Agency | Follow-On Contract for infrastructure upgrade-creation of Eastern Entrance to the city of Montego Bay-Elegant Corridor, St James | 21,588,670.15 |
| National Works Agency | Follow-On contract for the patching of roadways in the community of Lilliput. | 4,438,317.51 |
| St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Refugee Temple, Greenwood Stoplight, Suga Pepper Restaurant and Iberostar | 28,972,916.25 |
| St. James Municipal | Landscaping works to the entrances of Rosehall Deluxe, Grange Pen, Greenwood, Long Bay | 29,715,432.19 |
| St. James Municipal | Construction of walls and sign bases as the Success Craft Market, Barrett Hall and Lilliput entrances carried out | 6,072,944.22 |
| National Solid Waste Management Authority | Highway planting along Elegant Corridor | 29,998,526.00 |
| National Solid Waste Management Authority | Proposed landscaping- Additional Planting along Elegant Corridor, St. James (Success to Montego Bay Airport Roundabout) | 22,357,525.00 |
| St. James Municipal | Flankers Vending and sports complex- Phase 1 upgrade | 16,435,109.25 |
| St. James Municipal | Phase 2 upgrade- execute the construction of multipurpose court, chain-link fencing, foot-path bridge and landscaping to Flankers Vending and Sports Complex. | 17,844,544.64 |
| Westmoreland Municipal | Rehabilitation of the football field at Negril Mini-Stadium- Ph2 | 15,686,182.35 |
| Contractor No. 5 | Proposed Concrete roof to main office building at Rafters Rest, Rio Grande Portland | 4,294,920.00 |
| Contractor No. 11 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of the marking stone beach, Annotto Bay St. Mary | 28,129,422.00 |
| Contractor No. 12 | Rehabilitation and upgrading of Lyssons Beach | 30,460,002.00 |
| TOTAL | | 285,852,136.84 |

Appendix 8: Employment Positions Engaged without Evidence of Competitive Process

| Position | Type of Engagement | Competitive Process Internal/External | |
|---|---|---------------------------------------|---|
| | | Interview | Advertisement of Employment/Promotion Opportunities |
| Executive Director | Contract (Management Services Contract) | Process followed | No evidence seen of advertisement |
| Director, Product Development & Community Tourism | Fixed Term Contract | Process followed | No evidence seen of advertisement |
| Director, Projects (Acting) | Fixed Term Contract | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Director, Corporate Services | Full Time | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Director, Product Quality & Training | Full Time | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Financial Controller | Fixed Term Contract | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Technical Services Manager | Full Time | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Executive Tourism Training Manager | Full Time | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Director, Public Procurement | Fixed Term Contract | Process followed | No evidence seen of advertisement |
| Chief Information Officer | Full Time | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |
| Company Secretary | Full Time | No evidence of interview seen on file | No evidence seen of internal advertisement/memorandum |

Appendix 9: Posts Engaged without Required Qualification

| Post Assigned/ Engaged | Period Engaged | Emoluments | | Qualification | | Qualification Requirement Not Met | TPDCo Response (October 1, 2021, Draft Report) |
|---|--|-------------|-------------|----------------------------------|---|--|--|
| | | Basic Pay | Traveling | Required | Possesses | | |
| Operations Manager-Attractions | Sept 7, 2015 | \$1,633,527 | \$894,924 | Diploma in Hotel Management | 6 CXC | Officer does not hold the required qualification | Subsequent review informed the audit that the incumbent has since enrolled in a bachelor's degree in psychology at the UWI Western Campus. There was no formal Degree Certificate submitted despite the progress report indicating that the officer enrolled in the Programme from 2015/16. |
| Project Accounting Officer | May 10, 2010 Appointed wef April 24, 2020 | \$1,530,681 | \$597,048 | BSc. in Management or Accounting | CXC | Officer does not hold the required qualification. Associate Degree in Hospitality, Entertainment and Tourism (Pending) NB. Officer has course re-sit in order to be awarded the Degree. | No further update submitted by TPDCo |
| Destination Assurance Manager (Portland and St. Thomas) | February 20, 2017 | \$3,336,319 | \$1,341,624 | Master's degree in Tourism et al | Bachelor's degree in Banking and Finance | Officer does not hold the required qualification. Officer's qualification not in line with required qualification | Officer subsequently obtained master's degree, Management Studies, on July 16, 2021, from the UWI, Mona. |
| Destination Assurance Manager (South Coast) | December 17, 2018 | \$3,017,193 | \$1,542,864 | Master's degree in Tourism et al | Bachelor of Business Administration in Production and Operations Management | Officer does not hold the required qualification. Officer's qualification not in line with required qualification | No further qualification certificate or progress report submitted by TPDCo |
| Destination Assurance Manager (Falmouth) | February 19, 2018 | \$3,771,491 | \$1,341,624 | Master's degree in Tourism et al | Bachelor of Science in Management Studies | Officer does not hold the required qualification. Officer's qualification not in line with required qualification | No further qualification certificate or progress report submitted by TPDCo |

| | | | | | | | |
|---|--|-------------|-------------|--|--|--|---|
| Destination Assurance Manager (Kingston) | June 1, 2020 | \$3,168,053 | \$1,697,148 | Master's degree in Tourism et al | 3 CXC & 1 GCE Pass | Officer not qualified for the post. Officer does not hold the minimum educational requirement of a master's degree | Subsequent review informed the audit that the incumbent has since enrolled in a bachelor's Programme in Hospitality at UCC. This, however, would still not allow the officer to meet the minimum required qualification. |
| Budget Officer | First employed contractually effective August 21, 2017 May 13, 2019 (current position on 2-year contract) | \$1,555,740 | \$894,924 | BSc. in Management or Accounting | Basic Accounting 1 & 11 (MIND) | ASC. Degree (Pending) Officer completed year 1 of a 2-year programme Officer commenced a 4-year part-time BSc in Accounting & Financial Management in 2018 at UCC. (Pending) | TPDCo submitted a progress report indicating the officer's enrollment in a Bachelor Programme at UCC. |
| Chief Information Officer | September 19, 2005 | \$3,318,912 | \$1,697,148 | Master's degree in information or Computer Science | ISACA - Certified Information Security Manager Certificate in AIX Administration Diploma - Data Processing Certificate - RPGII Programming (DATAPROX) | Officer does not hold the required qualification. Officer's qualification not in line with required qualification | No further qualification certificate or progress report submitted by TPDCo. |

Acronyms and Abbreviations

| | |
|----------------|--|
| AuGD | Auditor General Department |
| CEO | Chief Executive Officer |
| CRUP | Comprehensive Resort Upgrading Programme |
| ED | Executive Director |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| GOJ | Government of Jamaica |
| HRMD | Human Resource Management and Development |
| IAU | Internal Audit Unit |
| INTOSAI | International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions |
| JCDC | Jamaica Cultural Development Commission |
| JEEP | Jamaica Emergency Employment Programme |
| JTB | Jamaica Tourist Board |
| KPIs | Key Performance Indicators |
| KSAMC | Kingston and St. Andrew Municipal Corporation |
| MoT | Ministry of Tourism |
| NSWMA | National Solid Waste Management Authority |
| NWA | National Works Agency |
| MC | Municipal Corporation |
| PBMA | Public Bodies Management and Accountability |
| RADA | Rural Agricultural Development Authority |
| SDC | Social Development Commission |
| SDF | Social Development Fund |
| SOP | Standard Operating Procedure |
| TEF | Tourism Enhancement Fund |
| TIP | Tourism Improvement Programme |
| TPDCo | Tourism Product Development Company |

